

**《A Quest for the Universal: George Turnbull's
Conception of Painting》 (1)**

Masahiro Hamashita

要約

普遍への追究—ジョージ・ターンバルの絵画論研究 (1)

浜下 昌宏

ジョージ・ターンバル (George Turnbull, 1698-1748) の伝記的資料も研究誌も乏しい。しかし、19世紀後半の哲学史ではすでに McCosh, Veitch, Cousin などによって、同時代のスコットランドの思想家のなかでも高い評価が与えられていた。今日、スコットランド啓蒙研究の深化と共に彼の研究が進みつつあり、たんにトマス・リードの師としての功績のみならず、美学的視点から見ても、イギリスにおける芸術論の展開、近代におけるギリシャ崇拜、三代伯シャフツベリのスコットランドにおける思想的影響などを考えるとき、彼は注目すべき研究対象である。ターンバルの生涯を彼の思想の反映と解するならば、合邦とハノーヴァー朝定着に向けた政治的激動と、大学を中心とした教育改革の動きのなかで、スコットランドを離れてロンドンで活躍の場を求め、長老派教会から監督派教会に転向した歩みは、たんに地方から中央への社会的上昇志向というよりも偏狭の心性を脱しての普遍への思想的追究と理解することが可能であろう。その際、普遍的理念を提供したのは、文化モデルとしてのギリシャ精神の崇拜であり、また青年の教育理念としての普遍的人類の観念、そして自然哲学と道徳哲学との統合であった。しかし前者については、ターンバルのギリシャ崇拜は当時の教養人共通のギリシャへの懐古的尊崇感情の域を出ていない。教育論については、青年の統合的人格教育の理想を、自然哲学の成果の十全な活用を通して実現しようとするが、道徳哲学の一部としての絵画論にその端的な試みを見ることができる。[それについての詳論は次号の予定。]

Introduction: the context and access to Turnbull's aesthetics

- A. Life and career
- B. Remarks on Turnbull by his contemporaries
- C. The subscribers
- D. Access to *Treatise*
- I. Cues for the universal
 - A. Philhellenism
 - B. Liberal education
- II. Conception of painting
 - A. Painting for moral education
 - B. Analogy between the natural and the moral: integration of natural philosophy and moral philosophy
 - C. Two genres of painting
 - D. Painting as experiment
- Conclusion

【INTRODUCTION: The Context and Access to Turnbull's Aesthetics】

It is a pity and unbelievable that no entry for George Turnbull (1698, Alloa – 1748, The Hague) appears even in *«The Dictionary of National Biography»*. Is this due to mere neglect of him or the difficulty of locating him in modern thought? In fact, even in writing on his biography we have difficulty finding good material sources. Though we may regret his being out of sight in the main stream of the history of ideas, and we have no monographic book on Turnbull, when we consider the development of modern aesthetics, art theories in Britain, the phases of modern philhellenism, and the influence of Shaftesbury in Scotland, he cannot be ignored.

Fortunately, 1992 saw *«Chambers Scottish Biographical Dictionary»*¹ published, in which the article of Turnbull is included, the ending of which reads: "A philosopher with important ideas on the interconnections in knowledge, his work is now being revived"².

Before proceeding into the main topic, it would be necessary to treat something about this forlorn thinker's life and at the same time to obtain some hints to aid our inquiry.

[A. Life and career]

George Turnbull was born in 1698³ at Alloa, a tiny village near Stirling. At Alloa his father was a minister of the Presbyterian Church. After graduating from the University of Edinburgh, he worked as a regent of Marischal College at Aberdeen from 1721 to 1727. For reasons which are not yet clear, he resigned the post of regent. Then during missing years in his biography he is believed to have toured Europe as a tutor to the Wauchopes of Niddry, an eminent family near Edinburgh. His stay in Italy during 1735–37 as tutor

to Thomas Watson, son of Lord Rockingham, enabled him to conceive the plan for *«Treatise on Ancient Painting»*. Allan Ramsay, Jr was also then in Italy, and looked after Turnbull's interest in securing illustrations by an Italian painter named Paderni even after Turnbull returned home⁴.

Among his works, which amounts to about 15 books, most interesting from the aesthetic point of view is, needless to say, *«Treatise on Ancient Painting»*, published in 1740. From 1740 to 1742, his marvelously prolific activity produced as many as 11 books. The list is as follows:

- 1740 : *An Impartial Enquiry into the Moral Character of Jesus Christ. . .In a letter to a friend.*
[Signed, Philalethes, i.e. G.Turnbull]
- 1740 : *The Principles of Moral Philosophy: an Inquiry into the wise and good government of the Moral World*, 2 vols., London: John Noon. [The titlepage of vol. 2 reads: " The Principles of Moral and Christian Philosophy"]
- 1740 : *Christian Philosophy: or, the Christian doctrine concerning God, providence . . .*, London: John Noon. [published as vol.II of *Principles*]
- 1740 : *A Treatise on Ancient Painting*, London: A.Millar.
- 1740 : *Three Dissertations; one on the characters of Augustus, Horace and Agrippa, with a comparison between his two ministers Agrippa and Maecenas, by the Abbé de Vertot . . . Another on the Gallery of Verres by Abbé Fraguier . . . A Third on the nature,origin and use of masks, in theatrical representations among the ancients, by Mr.Boindin,etc.*, London: R.Dodsley. [Trans. and edited by G.Turnbull]
- 1741 : *A Curious Collection of Ancient Paintings . . . With an account where and when they were found, and where they are now are; and several critical, historical, and mythological observations upon them*, London. [by G. T., i. e. G.Turnbull]
- 1741 : *Animadversions upon . . . T.Chubb's "Discourse upon Miracles". To which is added, an appendix, containing Dr.Turnbull's Queries, etc.*
- 1741 : J.G.Heineccius, *A Methodical System of Universal Law: or the Laws of Nature and Nations deduced from Certain Principles and applied to Proper Cases. Translated and illustrated with notes and supplements by George Turnbull. To which is added A Discourse upon the Nature and Origine of Moral and Civil Laws*, 2 vols, London: G. Keith.
- 1742 : *Observations upon Liberal Education in all its branches; containing the substance of what hath been said upon that important subject by the best writers ancient and modern.* London: A.Millar.
- 1742 : *Justin's History of the World translated into English. With a prefatory discourse . . . By a gentleman of the Universe of Oxford* [G. Turnbull].
- 1743 : BLAINVILLE (de), ci-devant Secretaire d'Ambassade en Espagne;*Travels through Holland, Germany, Switzerland, etc.* [vol.1 trans. by G.Turnbull].

After leaving Aberdeen, he seems to have settled in London, and in 1741, he became an honorary chaplain to Frederick Louis (1707–1751), Prince of Wales, who was the eldest son of King George II (1683–1760) and the rival of the Duke of Cumberland, second son of George II. He was living at Kew, West London, taking in a few pupils. And in 1742

he at last obtained only his second, and last, stable job, as rector of Drumachose, a scattered Irish parish of the Episcopal Church in a small country town of Limavady. He died in 1748, at the Hague where he was staying to heal his weak health.

Even though my sketch of his life is rough, from that, we can assume his motive or reason for the decision to transfer from Scotland to London, which was not unusual at that time among many intellectuals in Scotland and Ireland who tried to find the place for successful activity in London.

His life time from 1698 to 1748 overlapped the British movement toward the Union, i.e., the days of the dilemma for the Scots over the compromise with the English, and over the establishment of the rule of the Hanoverians in place of the Stuarts. He lived in the most violent days in the history of Scotland.

He didn't seem to be involved in politics and remained a prolific author through the historically shaking time. Indeed; Turnbull might have been, as Prof. Stewart says, 'academically ambitious and something of a social climber'⁵. But, such a remark will fail to explore the meaning or intention concealed in each of his activities.

We must wonder about reasons for his resignation from the regent at Marischall College, Aberdeen University. In fact, at the time when hot arguments over innovation of the educational system were rising, his too early departure seems surprising. We can assume it as disappointment or protest against the authorities at Marischal College. Abolition of the regent system was a trend in Scottish universities then, to make way for professorships with teaching specialities.

His intention to get B.C.L. [Bachelor of Civil Law] at Oxford must have been to prepare for entry to the Episcopal Church. And, one of the reasons he attended meetings of the Society for the Encouragement of Learning regularly from April 1737 to May 1739 must have been to expect at one time to have their support for his *«Treatise on Ancient Painting»*⁶.

Connexions with Thomas Birch, then treasurer of the Society for the Encouragement of Learning, may have helped him to obtain ordination by Bishop Hoadly.

[B. Remarks on Turnbull by his contemporaries]

His life-time coincides not only with the time of the Union but also the time of the Scottish Enlightenment. What was his contribution, if any, to the Scottish Enlightenment?

Veitch discussed him alongside Carmichel and Hutcheson, though he criticized his neglect by historians of ideas. He claims, "Turnbull had a very direct influence on Scottish thought, for he was the master of Reid, and there can be no doubt that Reid got from him much that is distinctive in his method and system"⁷. Veitch adds, "Turnbull has been cursorily referred to by Stewart and Hamilton, but it was Cousin who, in his most painstaking and interesting history of the Scottish Philosophy, first did justice to Turnbull and his influence on Reid"⁸. According to Veitch, "Turnbull owes much to Hutcheson, which he frankly acknowledges; he refers also to Shaftesbury and Pope; he is familiar with the new physical views of Newton; he is full of the modern spirit of inquiry;

and there is withal a remarkable vein of originality and freshness in his speculative investigations. But for the fact that he left Scotland at an early age, and seems never to have returned, his writings would have been long ago recognised as an important and influential element in Scottish thought”⁹.

Turnbull has been neglected not merely by history of ideas but by history of art theory. After its first appearance in 1740, *«Treatise»* was never republished and received little critical attention.

Among his contemporaries, one of the few who referred to the existence of Turnbull’s *«Treatise»* was the painter, Hogarth. In Hogarth’s print entitled “Beer Street” (1750), at the right side of the picture a porter is drinking beer from a mug with a pile of books for sale beside him. Among them is one book on whose spine is written ‘Turnbull on Ancient Painting’. McCosh writes regretfully, “Turnbull was one of the most voluminous writers of his age. I have read many thousand pages written by him; but I fear the greater part of the copies of his works have gone to the destiny indicated by Hogarth”¹⁰. It is difficult to understand what Hogarth meant exactly by his print. One interpretation might be that Hogarth caricatures Turnbull’s views on liberal education through pictures accepted only by civilised people as opposed to the common people depicted in Hogarth’s print.

As C.Gibson-Wood remarks, even either side of the controversy of the Ancient-Modern dismissed Turnbull’s book¹¹. One of his distinguished contemporaries, J.W. Winckelmann, the great philhellene, in his *«Gedanken über die Nachahmung der griechischen Werke in der Malerei und Bildhauerkunst»* (Dresden, 1755; English translation by Henry Fuseli, *«Reflections on the Painting and Sculpture of the Greeks»*, London: A. Millar, 1765), made a severe criticism, saying that it was the plates alone which gave ‘some value to the magnificent and abused paper’ [trans. Fuseli, *ibid.*, p.53] of Turnbull’s work.

It is uncertain how famous he was in his life-time. The following anecdotes offer contrasts. Once, Warburton, Thomas Birch’s much closer friend, responding to pressure to buy *«The Principles of Moral Philosophy»* (in which Warburton’s defence of Pope receives passing commendation), told Birch: “I never heard of Dr. Turnbull, nor his book, before your account of it”¹². On the other hand, Allan Ramsay wrote to David Hume in 1756 (after Turnbull died): “to write like a deep philosopher we must write like Turnbull or Plato”¹³. But such eulogies are hard to find in his life-time.

[C. The Subscribers]

«Treatise» itself is available today, because fortunately we have a facsimile reprint (München: Wilhelm Fink Verlag, 1971) edited by Vincent Bevilacqua with his excellent introduction. However this edition is not the exact reproduction, as Bevilacqua indicates in “Preface”: “No changes have been made in the text; but owing to financial demands, the original folio edition has been reduced to the present size, four fifths of the original, and the plates depicting ‘Fifty Pieces of Ancient Painting’ appended to the first edition have not been included”¹⁴. The plates he mentions were painted by the Neapolitan painter Camillo Paderni to whom Turnbull was introduced by Allan Ramsay, and then gravely by

J. Mynde who worked in London. Paderni copied from the private collection of ancient paintings in Italy and from works of Santi Bartoli, which again Ramsay succeeded in getting for Richard Mead, M.D., who was one of the subscribers of *Treatise* and through whose influence Bevilacqua thinks Turnbull took interest in ancient painting¹⁵. In addition, though Bevilacqua doesn't mention it, another thing is omitted in the reprint edition, i.e., subscribers' names. There appear 178 names in all, including persons and institutions, among whom there is the Countess of Shaftesbury, which suggests his connection with the Shaftesbury family, and 2nd Earl of Stanhope, to whom Turnbull dedicated his *Principles of Moral Philosophy*, and 40 other peers. Two Colleges in Cambridge (Trinity and St.John's), and one in Oxford (Exeter), and the Advocates Library, Edinburgh, are also found in the list. Personal names are, for example, a subscriber of 13 copies, Andrew Wauchope, whose tutor Turnbull was for 5 years from about 1727; William Adam, the architect, father of Robert Adam; James Thomson, poet of *«Seasons»*, Gavin Hamilton, painter, who bought 12 books. As contemporary connoisseurs and men of learning, included in the subscribers are John Armstrong (c.1709–79), Scottish physician and poet, who got M.D. at Edinburgh in 1732, and soon after commenced practice in London and a friend of Fuseli; Hans Sloane (1660–1753), the son of an Ulster Scot, settled in London as a Physician, secretary (1693–1713) and president (1727) of the Royal Society, whose museum and library of 50,000 volumes and 3,560 MSS. formed the nucleus of the British Museum; John Dalrymple (1673–1747), Scottish soldier, who devoted himself to agriculture, growing turnips and cabbages; Martin Folkes (1690–1754), English numismatist; and Joseph Spence (1699–1768), Professor of poetry at Oxford and the author of *«Polymetis»* .

Turnbull's friends from his days at Edinburgh also supported his publication. One of them is Robert Wallace and another is Andrew Mitchell (both were members of the Rankenian Club). His brother, Thomas Turnbull's name is found in the list, too.

What is of special interest we feel from the subscribers' names is the fact that it fully suggests his Scottish connections. His friends at the Rankenian Club in Edinburgh, eminent peers of Scotland such as the Duke of Argyle, Duke of Athol, Duke of Gordon, etc., and Scottish politicians and lawyers of distinction such as Robert Dundas, Andrew Mitchell, Robert Wallace, and William Murray, etc., and learned men and artists such as Armstrong, Sloane, and James Thomson who all eventually settled in London.

Much more interestingly, above names tell evidently his time and his position. 2nd Duke of Argyle was a prominent Unionist and supporter of the Hanoverians, whose generalship caused the defeat of the Jacobite insurgents in 1715–16, and Philip York, Earl of Hardwicke presided at the trial of the rebel lords in 1745 and promoted the laws that proscribed tartan and abolished heritable jurisdiction in Scotland. Another promoter of the Union is the Earl of Hopetoun. Turnbull's friend, Andrew Mitchell studied at Edinburgh at the same time as David Hume and Lord Kames, and became M.P. and British envoy to Frederick the Great, ever doubting Kames to be a Jacobite. John Dalrymple, 2nd Earl of Stair, retired as general to Edinburgh, his birthplace, to intrigue for the Hanoverian succession, and then was appointed ambassador to Paris under George I to check-

mate the Pretender.

Thus we know his association with the promoters of the Union and the Hanoverians, with anti-Jacobites and with those who contributed to the Anglicization of Scotland. One of his books of translation *«Heineccius's Methodical System of Universal Law»* (1741) was dedicated to the Duke of Cumberland, who is notorious for the cruel massacre after defeating the Highlanders at the battle of Culloden.

So far, the context of Turnbull's aesthetics.

But not yet the time to enter his text, but the pretext must be still needed.

[D. Access to *«Treatise»*]

In what sense is Turnbull's aesthetics worth studying?

Firstly, why was his *«Treatise»* so neglected by his contemporaries, I'd like to know the reason.

Secondly, it is important to know, in history of art theories, how far he was influenced by the preceding theories, and how extensive was his knowledge of painters of his day.

Thirdly, what is the relationship in ideas between Shaftesbury's moral philosophy and aesthetics and those of Turnbull's? Their relationship surely constitutes a part of modern British aesthetics.

Fourthly, as a thinker in the Enlightenment, the interconnection between his theological ideas, religious interests, educational designs, and aesthetic thought is remarkable.

And lastly, as my introductory description indicates, how do his aesthetic ideas correspond to his career and his time? His career can be rightly called the runaway from the Scottish. And from Scotland, where did he seek to reach?

Gibson-Wood's understanding that "Turnbull's purposes in writing the *Treatise* had been mainly to develop a theory of education, not a new theory of art"¹⁶ is only partly true. Indeed Turnbull's intention to reform education is one of the consistent ones found in *«Observation upon Liberal Education»* (1742) and the preface to *«Justin's History of the World translated into English»* (1742), as well as *«Treatise»*. His experience at Marischal must have brought home to Turnbull how important an educational reform really is for young people. During that time he sent a letter to Robert Molesworth, Shaftesbury's confessed disciple, from Aberdeen, saying: "And in my publick Profession shal [sic] always make it my business to promote the interests of Liberty and Vertue & to reform the taste of the Young Generation. But oh! My Lord, Education in this country is upon a miserable footing; And why should I say in this country, for is it not almost Every where?"¹⁷. Which country is indicated by "in this country"? Needless to say, it is Scotland.

Fifteen years later, in "A Preface Concerning Education, Travelling, and the Fine Arts" prefixed to *«Treatise»*, he never uses 'the English' nor 'the Scots', but 'the British': "Tis no doubt owing to our sending our youth to be polished in France into genteel, pretty Behaviour (as it is called) a Complement that has been paid to that Nation by the British in particular, too, too long, that the French are the only People in the World who have the

very extraordinary politeness to tell all Strangers, that they alone understand Le sçavoir vivre; and the Commerce de la vie."¹⁸; " any of our young Travellers who return from France Fops and Cox combs, are ever recovered from their French Fluttering, Volatility, and Impertinence, and restored to that native Plainness and Seriousness of the British . . ."¹⁹.

It is obvious that he kept in his mind a citizen of the United Kingdom or the Commonwealth. And further, more remarkable is his statement which refers to 'love of mankind' as the end of education of the youth, emphasising 'forming Youth to Virtue and a good Taste of All the Arts . . .to form and improve . . . in young minds the Love of true knowledge, and the Love of Society, Mankind, and Virtue'²⁰.

Apart from his career, his idea was not only trans-Scottish, but it must be a product of his inquiry into the more universal. His scheme of *«Treatise»* can be said to be based on 'an international effort to understand ancient art, particularly painting'²¹. Thus my interest in this paper is to ascertain how the education for the universal through painting is possible.

【I.Cues for the Universal】

Considering his inquiry into the universal, insofar as his aesthetics is concerned, we will find at least two cues for it: philhellenism and painting. Accidentally, they seem to correspond to the title and the content of *«Treatise»*, i.e., 'ancient' to philhellenism, and 'painting' to itself.

[A. Philhellenism]

About the end of the seventeenth-century there emerged the modern tradition of hellenism in Western Europe. Its related concepts were history, landscape, travel, primitivism, ruins, architecture, sculpture, drama, philosophy, mythology, Homer, etc.²² Since the Renaissance onward classical philology has produced many translations of classical Greek and Latin texts.

In England, "Shaftesbury was really the founder of the British tradition of philhellenism"²³. In fact, Shaftesbury expresses admiration for the ancients in terms of cultural politeness. To Shaftesbury, the ancient Greece was the fountain of all divinity, philosophy, and 'polite learning'; 'the politest of all nations'; 'the sole polite, most civilized, and accomplished nation'²⁴. In fact, Shaftesbury says in his *«Characteristics»*: "As this intelligence in life and manners grew greater in that experienced people, so the relish of wit and humour would naturally in proportion be more refined. Thus GREECE in general grew more and more polite"²⁵. Thus, Shaftesbury and other philhellenists regarded ancient Greece as the standard of arts and the ideal model of culture²⁶. The ideological implication may be the ancient Greece idealised 'as the prototype of cultivated and liberal Whig democracy, in opposition to uncultivated Roman tyranny, a view clearly shaped by the events of 1688'.²⁷

From his younger days Turnbull read Shaftesbury with enthusiasm. His letter shows

it clearly. In his letter to Lord Molesworth (Aug.3, 1722, at Tinninghame, East Lothian), he says, " When the Earl of Shaftesbury's letters to you, that have been lately published, came to my hands, pardon me, My Lord, if it was then my esteem rose highest . . . Good and honest surely must he be who was the friend and trustee of the truly good and upright Shaftesbury. . .I have, My Lord, studied with care the works of that excellent man, and must own I never received so much real benefit from any uninspired writings, so incomparably perfect is the composure of all his pieces, and so divine the energy with which these form the genuine principles of virtue and goodness, and a true relish of beauty and truth of every sort in the mind of a well-disposed reader . . .I have often, My Lord, regretted that none of his friends have given the world an account of his life. Sure I am it would not be an idle tale, but a profitable history. . .May I presume, My Lord, to enquire of Your Lordship how a copy of the letter he wrote to an English Lord, with his piece upon the Judgment of Hercules, which, I am informed, was only printed with thirty copies of his works, may be procured, or if there is any thing else of his that I can have access to see. I have no news to write from this place that can be so agreeable to Your Lordship, as that, even in this narrow bigoted country, there are several of my acquaintance, who are sincere lovers of truth and liberty. . ."28. Really we can find in his books many references to Shaftesbury's *Characteristics*. Perhaps partly because of Shaftesbury's influence, Turnbull himself studied the Greek and Latin classics eagerly. After he settled as a regent in the new College of Aberdeen, he expressed his hope " to have Leisure to apply myself to the Study of the Ancients, the Study to which my humour & genius leads me"²⁹.

Among his subscribers of *Treatise* are found two names of persons who were members of the Society of Dilettanti, a leading group of modern philhellenists in England, which was founded in 1732 and contributed to the development of archaeology and typography and the taste of antiquities and antiques. Among them are the Earl of Rockingham and Joseph Spence.

But can we really call Turnbull a philhellenist?

In fact, it is easy to find in his letters and books more and more references to Greek and Latin classics. However, it was not unusual among intellectuals and authors of his time. Compared with, for example, Shaftesbury, Thomas Blackwell, and Winckelmann and others, his enthusiasm for hellenism is not so distinguished and rather moderate. The classical world only means to him, in common with Westerners' ordinary yearning for the origin of their civilisation, some universal model, i.e., the model or sample for learning as well as modern samples. He says in his *Observations upon Liberal Education* that good education can be based on the examples of great personages in both ancient and modern times³⁰. Thus, we had better not overestimate his philhellenism.

[B. Liberal Education]

Next, we will pay attention to his concept of painting.

Our first question concerning it must be how his interest in painting emerged. His interest in painting can be explained partly in terms of his ideas of educational reform.

At this time before and after his resignation as regent at Marischal, the reform of education in Scottish universities was in progress. We can trace its main movement in brief as follows.

1742 : Publication of G.Turnbull: *Observations upon Liberal Education In all its Branches*, London.

1752 : Under Blackwell's direction, and mainly by his exertions, the improved mode of instruction now followed in the College was introduced.³¹

1755 : The present system, by which each Professor is confined to the teaching of one branch of knowledge separately, was introduced at Marischal College.³²

1755: Publication of A.Gerard: *Plan of Education in the Marischal College and University of Aberdeen, with the Reasons of it*.

As a regent Turnbull himself must have been passionate for education of young people. Using Prof. Paul Wood's words, he was 'the most innovative regent of the 1720s'³³. Turnbull says, " in my public profession, [I] shall always make it my business to promote the interests of liberty and virtue and to reform the taste of the younger generation"³⁴, and complaining that, as I quoted above, " But oh! My Lord, education in this country is upon a miserable footing; and why should I say in this country, for is it not almost everywhere? "³⁵

He seems to have been proud of 'Having been long engaged in the important business of Education, as it was my duty'³⁶. So severe is his criticism against the present system of education. He attacks 'the Idle Pedantick Stuff', 'proud domineering pedantic Priests' and their 'Senseless metaphysical Creeds and Catechisms'³⁷, saying "'Tis in vain to heap rules on children; 'tis impossible for poor little ones to remember a tenth part of them, much less to observe them. But would you have them speak, read, pronounce, and behave gracefully, let them be formed by good example and practice, to intelligent graceful speaking and reading, and genteel behaviour. Pray remember, says Mr.Locke, . . . children are not to be taught by rules which will be always slipping out of their memories"³⁸. He thought 'the defects of education'³⁹ were due to teaching moral and natural philosophy separately, and the liberal arts independently of both⁴⁰ and scholastic learning.

At that time, ordinary curriculum consisted of languages such as Greek and Latin with 'making themes, verses, amplifications'; of subject which only leads students' 'memories with historical dates and aeras'; and of logic 'to teach them to rear up syllogisms in mood and figure, or to draw lines and figures upon paper'⁴¹. And Turnbull says, " These arts are, I deny not, useful and estimable, but as means, and not as the end"⁴². In fact, after Marischal reopened in 1717 after the turmoil of purging Jacobite Professors, the course of philosophy was divided into sections on logic, metaphysics, pneumatology and ethics, and physics, taught in that order. Significantly, none of the regents in this period questioned the primacy of logic; all were agreed that logic provided the proper methods for discovering truth, and one of the Professors [Hardie] claimed that it was 'the medicine of the soul and the torch of philosophy'⁴³.

Then, what was Turnbull's principal design for reforming education?

He intended to 'turn education from words to things'⁴⁴, arguing that " science, or real

knowledge, and not mere words, ought to be its principal object and scope"⁴⁵. What do these phrases imply?

Turnbull conceived of integration of natural science and humanities, and evaluated 'experimental method', which is sharply contrasted with Shaftesbury's attitude, who had much the same idea of restoring the wholesome education through aesthetics, neglecting accomplishment of modern analytic natural sciences⁴⁶.

Other eminent contemporaries of his also felt the need of educational reform. For example, Molesworth, as a Whig who promoted new constitution after the Union, insisted on education for the youth to be good citizens of Britain according to the demands from society and state. In contrast, Turnbull's idea of education was for moral teaching as a humankind. And to Thomas Blackwell, who was Principal of Marischal when Turnbull was a regent and whose students included George Campbell, A.Gerard, and Beattie, education means particularly that of classical Greek for more academic training. It is reported that he compelled a more regular attendance of the students, and expelled some of them who refused to submit to the authority of their teachers. He instituted or revived a practice among the Professors, of delivering discourses in public, and set the first example himself. Under his direction, and mainly by his exertions, the improved mode of instruction now followed in the College was introduced in the year 1752⁴⁷.

Turnbull's disgust for restraining young people by rules is because of his idea of education in full exercise of body and mind for the purpose of wholesome accomplishment. He says, let young children "speak, read, pronounce, and behave gracefully, let them be formed by good example and practice, to intelligent graceful speaking and reading, and genteel behaviour"⁴⁸.

And most of all, Turnbull's originality of idea of education is shown in his idea of the moral use of natural philosophy. "The great design for which we have recommended instructing youth early in natural philosophy, i.e., in the law of nature and final cause, is the moral use that may be made of this science, together with the improvement or extension of human power, which can only be brought about by advancing or cultivating the knowledge of nature. Youth ought to be taught and inured to ascend from instances of perfect wisdom and goodness in the creation, to the first Author of all beauty and good, and to pay the worship of heart that is due to such a Being."⁴⁹ Even from this passage, we can understand that his concept of natural philosophy extends to some theological and cosmological ideas.

Thus his intention to reform education was not according to demands from state, nor for the purpose of rigid academic learning and discipline, but is based in the belief of liberal education that 'improvement of arts and sciences' will lead to 'progress of virtue'⁵⁰.

According to him, the 'proper business of education' is to form in the mind of the youth 'universal good taste', following philosophy as 'the guide of life, the discerner of excellence, and the source of all truly manly, rational, and pure happiness'⁵¹.

How do such ideas lead to his conception of painting? This is our next question concerning Turnbull's inquiry into the universal.

[To be continued]

NOTES

- 1) ed. Rosemary Goring, Edinburgh & N.Y.: Chambers, 1992.
- 2) *ibid.*, p.438.
- 3) The year 1698 is very suggestive in that he was born in 'the formidable gap between the rigid Calvinism of the post-Revolution period and the polite Presbyterianism of the Moderate era' (R. Sher, *Church and University in the Scottish Enlightenment: The Moderate Literati of Edinburgh*, Princeton U.P., 1985, p.152). Turnbull belonged to the generation of Francis Hutcheson (b.1694), William Leechman (b.1706), James Oswald (b.1703), Robert Wallace (b.1697) and William Wishart (b.1692), all of whom were 'learned and liberal clergymen' (Sher, *ibid.*, p.152).
- 4) Stewart, M.A., "George Turnbull and Educational Reform", in J.J. Carter and J.H. Pittock ed., *Aberdeen and the Enlightenment*, Aberdeen, 1987, p.98.
- 5) *ibid.*, p.101.
- 6) *ibid.*, p.98.
- 7) Veitch, John, "Philosophy in the Scottish Universities", *Mind*, 2, 1877, p.212.
- 8) *ibid.*
- 9) *ibid.*, p.213.
- 10) McCosh, James, *The Scottish Philosophy*, London, 1875, p.95.
- 11) Cf. Gibson-Wood, Carol, "Painting as Philosophy: George Turnbull's *Treatise on Ancient Painting*", in J.J. Carter and J.H. Pittock ed., *Aberdeen and the Enlightenment*, Aberdeen, 1987, p.189.
- 12) Cf. Stewart, *ibid.*, p.98.
- 13) Cf. Smart, Alastair, *Allan Ramsay: Painter, Essayist and Man of the Enlightenment*, Yale U.P., 1992, p.138.
- 14) *A Treatise on Ancient Painting*, London: A. Millar, 1740; repr. München: Wilhelm Fink Verlag, 1971, edited by Vincent Bevilacqua, p.vi.
- 15) Cf. Bevilacqua, op. cit. p.VIII; Smart, op. cit. 1992, p.39.
- 16) op. cit. p.196.
- 17) Historical MSS Commission ed., *MSS in Various Collections*, Vol.8, London, 1913, p.343. = Letter to Lord Molesworth, 1722, Aug.3, at Tinninghame, East Lothian.
- 18) op.cit., p.xviii. Underline added.
- 19) *ibid.* Underline added.
- 20) *ibid.*, p.v.
- 21) Emerson, Roger L., "Conjectural history and Scottish philosophers", *Historical Papers* (Canadian Historical Association), 1984, p.81.
- 22) Cf. Webb, Timothy, *English Romantic Hellenism 1700-1824*, Manchester U.P., 1982, p.ix.
- 23) Macmillan, Duncan, *Painting in Scotland: the Golden Age*, Oxford, 1986, p.36.
- 24) Cf. Anthony, Earl of Shaftesbury, *Characteristics of Men, Manners, Opinions, Times*, 3 vols, London, 1711, III,138,152,231 (= Miscellany, III,i; V,i; Cf. Klein, L., "The Third Earl of Shaftesbury and the Progress of Politeness", *Eighteenth-Century Studies*, 18, no.2 (Winter 1984-5), p.211ff.
- 25) *ibid.*, I,250 = Soliloquy, II,ii.
- 26) Cf. *ibid.*, III,138f. = Miscellany, III,i.
- 27) Cf. Macmillan, op.cit., p.36.
- 28) Historical MSS Commission ed., op.cit., p.342f.
- 29) *ibid.*, p.343. = Letter to Lord Molesworth, Aug.3, 1722, at Tinninghame, East Lothian.
- 30) Cf. *Observations upon Liberal Education in all its branches; containing the substance of what hath been said upon that important subject by the best writers ancient and modern*, London: A. Millar,

- 1742, p.97.
- 31) Cf. Bruce, James, *Lives of Eminent Men of Aberdeen, Aberdeen*, 1841, p.303.
- 32) Cf. *ibid.*
- 33) Wood, Paul B., *The Aberdeen Enlightenment: The Arts Curriculum in the Eighteenth Century*, AUP, 1993, p.40.
- 34) Historical MSS Commission ed., op.cit., p.344.
- 35) *ibid.*
- 36) *Observations*, p.1.
- 37) Cf. Wood, op.cit., p.40.
- 38) *Observations*, pp.209–30.
- 39) Cf. *ibid.*, p.336.
- 40) Cf. *Treatise on Ancient Painting*, p.x.
- 41) *Observations*, p.273.
- 42) *ibid.*
- 43) Wood, op.cit., p.35.
- 44) *Observations*, p.iv.
- 45) *ibid.*, p.420.
- 46) Cf. Hamashita, M., "Conception of 'the Whole' in Shaftesbury's Aesthetics", *Aesthetics*, 6, 1994.
- 47) Cf. Bruce, op.cit., p.306.
- 48) *Observations*, pp.209–30.
- 49) *ibid.*, p.385.
- 50) *Observations*, p.120.
- 51) *Treatise*, p.137.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

[Dictionaries, etc.]

- Chambers, Robert, *Biographical Dictionary of Eminent Scotsmen*, Glasgow, 1835.
- Chambers Biographical Dictionary*, ed. by J.O. Thorne, Edinburgh & London, 1972.
- Chambers Scottish Biographical Dictionary*, ed. R. Goring, Edinburgh & N.Y., 1992.
- Dictionary of National Biography*, ed. by L. Stephen & S. Lee, London, 1885–1900.
- Historical MSS Commission ed., *MSS in Various Collections*, Vol.8, London, 1913.
- Paul, R., ed., *The Diary of the Rev. George Turnbull*, Edinburgh: Scottish History Society Publications, 1893.

[Works of George Turnbull]

- Theses Philosophicae de Scientiae Naturalis cum Philosophia Morali Conjunctione*, Aberdeen: J. Nicol, 1723.
- A Philosophical Enquiry [Inquiry] c [C] concerning the Connexion betwixt [between] the Doctrines and Miracles of Jesus Christ*, London: R. Willock, 1731 [e.p.1726].
- Christianity neither False nor Useless*, London: R. Willock, 1732.
- An Essay to Prove the Usefulness, Truth, and Excellency of the Christian Religion*, 1732.
- An Impartial Enquiry into the Moral Character of Jesus Christ. . . In a letter to a friend* [Signed, Philalethes, i.e. G. Turnbull], 1740.
- The Principles of Moral Philosophy: an Inquiry into the wise and good government of the Moral World*, 2 vols., London: John Noon, 1740. (rpt. Hildesheim: Georg Olms Verlag, 1976) [The titlepage of vol.2 reads: "The Principles of Moral and Christian Philosophy"]

- Christian Philosophy: or, the Christian doctrine concerning God, providence . . .*, London: John Noon, 1740 [published as vol.II of *Principles of Moral Philosophy*]
- A Treatise on Ancient Painting*, London: A.Millar, 1740. (rpt. ed.V.M. Bevilacqua, München: Wilhelm Fink Verlag, 1971)
- Three Dissertations; one on the characters of Augustus, Horace and Agrippa, with a comparison between his two ministers Agrippa and Maecenas, by the Abbé de Vertot . . . Another on the Gallery of Verres by Abbé Fraguier . . . A Third on the nature, origin and use of masks, in theatrical representations among the ancients, by Mr.Boindin,etc.* [Trans. and edited by G.Turnbull], London: R.Dodsley, 1740.
- A Curious Collection of Ancient Paintings . . . With an account where and when they were found, and where they are now are; and several critical, historical, and mythological observations upon them* [by G.T.,i.e. G. Turnbull], 1741; ed.1744, London.
- Animadversions upon . . . T.Chubb's "Discourse upon Miracles". To which is added, an appendix, containing Dr.Turnbull's Queries, etc.,*1741.
- J.G.Heineccius, *A Methodical System of Universal Law: or the Laws of Nature and Nations deduced from Certain Principles and applied to Proper Cases*. Translated and illustrated with notes and supplements by George Turnbull. To which is added *A Discourse upon the Nature and Origine of Moral and Civil Laws*, 2 vols, London: G.Keith, 1741.
- Observations upon Liberal Education in all its branches; containing the substance of what hath been said upon that important subject by the best writers ancient and modern*, London: A.Millar, 1742.
- Justin's History of the World translated into English. With a prefatory discourse . . . By a gentleman of the Universe of Oxford* [G.Turnbull],1742. [Trans.from the Latin . . .By G.Turnbull,etc.]
- Blainville (de), ci-devant Secretaire d'Ambassade en Espagne; *Travels through Holland, Germany, Switzerland, etc.* [vol.1 trans. by G.Turnbull], 1743. [ed.1758—Trans.by G.Turnbull,LL.D. and William Guthrie]

[Secondary Sources]

- Allan, David, *Virtue, Learning and the Scottish Enlightenment*, Edinburgh U.P., 1993.
- Barrell, John, *The Political Theory of Painting From Reynolds To Hazlitt*, Yale U.P., 1986.
- Bevilacqua,Vincent, "introduction" to the edition of Turnbull's *Treatise on Ancient Painting*, rep. ed. V.M.Bevilacqua, München: Wilhelm Fink Verlag, 1971.
- Bruce,James, *Lives of Eminent Men of Aberdeen*, Aberdeen, 1841.
- Copley,Stephen, "The Fine Arts in Eighteenth-Century Polite Culture", in J.Barrell ed., *Painting and the Politics of Culture: New Essays on British Art 1700–1850*, Oxford U.P., 1992.
- Davie,G.E., "Berkeley's Impact on Scottish Philosophers", *Philosophy*, 40 (1965).
- Dobai,Johannes, *Die Kunstliteratur des Klassizismus und der Romantik in England*,3 Bde, München: Benteli, 1974, Bd.I, SS.669–80.
- Emerson,Roger L., "Conjectural history and Scottish philosophers", *Historical Papers* (Canadian Historical Association),1984.
- idem., *Professors, Patronage and Politics: The Aberdeen Universities in the Eighteenth Century*, AUP, 1992.
- Forbes,D., *Hume's Philosophical Politics*, Cambridge U.P., 1975.
- Gibson-Wood,Carol, "Painting as Philosophy: George Turnbull's *Treatise on Ancient Painting*", in J.J.Carter and J.H.Pittock ed., *Aberdeen and the Enlightenment*, Aberdeen, 1987.
- Jones, Peter, "The Scottish Professoriate and the Polite Academy, 1720–46", in I.Hont & M.Ignatieff eds., *Wealth and Virtue*, Cambridge U.P., 1983.
- Klein,L., "The Third Earl of Shaftesbury and the Progress of Politeness", *Eighteenth-Century*

- Studies*, 18, no.2 (Winter 1984–5).
- Laird, J., "George Turnbull", *Aberdeen University Review*, 14 (1926–27).
- Lipking, Lawrence, *The Ordering of the Arts in Eighteenth-Century England*, Princeton U.P., 1970.
- Mackinnon, K.A.B., "George Turnbull's Common Sense Jurisprudence", in J.J. Carter and J.H. Pittock ed., *Aberdeen and the Enlightenment*, Aberdeen, 1987.
- McCosh, James, *The Scottish Philosophy*, London, 1875.
- Macmillan, Duncan, *Painting in Scotland: the Golden Age*, Oxford, 1986.
- Norton, D.F., "George Turnbull and the Furniture of the Mind" *JHI*, 36 (1975).
- idem., *David Hume, Common Sense Moralist, Sceptical Metaphysician*, Princeton U.P., 1982.
- Ramsay, John (of Ochtertyre), *Scotland and Scotsmen in the Eighteenth Century*, Edinburgh & London, 1888.
- Rendall, Jane, *The Origins of the Scottish Enlightenment 1707–1776*, Macmillan, 1978.
- Robbins, C., *The Eighteenth-Century Commonwealthman*, Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard U.P., 1959.
- Ross, I.S., *Lord Kames and the Scotland of His Day*, Oxford, 1972.
- Sher, Richard B., *Church and University in the Scottish Enlightenment*, Princeton, 1985.
- Smart, Alastair, *Allan Ramsay: Painter, Essayist and Man of the Enlightenment*, Yale U.P., 1992.
- Solkin, David, "ReWrighting Shaftesbury: The Air Pump and the Limits of Commercial Humanism", in J. Barrell ed., *Painting and the Politics of Culture: New essays on British Art 1700–1850*, Oxford U.P., 1992.
- Stewart, M.A., "Berkeley and the Rankenian Club", *Hermathena*, 139 (1985).
- idem., "George Turnbull and Educational Reform", in J.J. Carter and J.H. Pittock ed., *Aberdeen and the Enlightenment*, Aberdeen, 1987.
- idem. ed., *Studies in the Philosophy of the Scottish Enlightenment*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990.
- Stewart–Robertson, J.C., "The well-principled savage, or the child of the Scottish Enlightenment", *JHI*, 42 (1981).
- Ulman, H. Lewis, *The Minutes of the Aberdeen Philosophical Society 1758–1773*, AUP, 1990.
- Veitch, John, "Philosophy in the Scottish Universities", *Mind*, 2, 1877.
- Webb, Timothy, *English Romantic Hellenism 1700–1824*, Manchester U.P., 1982.
- Wood, Paul B., *The Aberdeen Enlightenment: The Arts Curriculum in the Eighteenth Century*, AUP, 1993.

(Received April 17, 1995)