

In other words と認知語用論：BNC と CSPA のデータによる分析¹

東 森 勲

Summary

In other words and cognitive pragmatics: An analysis based on the data from BNC and CSPA

Isao HIGASHIMORI

E-mail: i-higasi@mail.kobe-c.ac.jp

The purpose of this paper is to account for the following correlation of discourse connectives from the relevance-theoretic point of view.

- 1 : SO+IN OTHER WORDS
- 2 : I MEAN+IN OTHER WORDS
- 3 : YOU KNOW+IN OTHER WORDS
- 4 : WELL+IN OTHER WORDS
- 5 : BUT+IN OTHER WORDS

First, we have looked at some existing dictionaries and indicated their insufficiencies about the above collocations. Second, we have gathered some interesting data from British National Corpus and Corpus of Spoken Professional American English (1998). And finally, I have raised some problems with them and shown how to explain these collocations from the cognitive pragmatics (i.e. relevance-theoretic) point of view.

0. はじめに

認知語用論の目的は発話理解の際に聞き手が頭の中で行っている認知原則を解明することである。本稿の目的は談話のなかでの *in other words* の働き²について、British National Corpus (BNC) および Corpus of Spoken Professional American English (CSPA) のデータをおもに分析しながら、従来の認知語用論（関連性理論）ではまだ指摘されていない認知原則の解明と、その説明を試みることである。

本論に入る前に少し実例を見てみよう。BNC には *in other words* は3223例あり、(1) のように *creative thought* を言い換えて *imagination* とのべている場合などがある。より専門的で、簡潔な語が *imagination* という語であると考えられる。

(1) It is also a cliché that computers are incapable of creative thought—*in other words*, imagination.

また、(2) は特におもしろい例で、通例は外国人にまず *kanji* (漢字) と言っても外来語で分からないので、それでより分かるように説明するのに、*in other words* を用いてあとで *Chinese characters* で説明的に言い換えて終わりだが、ここでは最後の漢字は日本語の書き言葉を表す専門語として、用いられており、(the written language) → (the Chinese characters → the *kanji*) と3つの言い換え関係が並列されていることに注意。

(2) But the thing that I found most fascinating of all about the Japanese language is the written language—*in other words*, the Chinese characters, or the *kanji*.

(でも、日本語で最も魅力を感じたのは、書き言葉——要するに、中国文字、つまり漢字です。) —Jack Halpern 『インタビューフラッシュ日本編1』1993, p. 24 (アルク)

このように *in other words* が具体的に用いられている状況理解には、かなりの知識で何が類似した表現であるかが問われるので、まさに認知的に同じものの言い換えに関わることがわかる。

1. In other words に関する辞書記述とその問題点

以下でつなぎ語に関する辞書記述のなかで、*in other words* はどのように述べられているかをまず見てみよう。

1.1. W.J. Ball (1997) 『あいづちつなぎ語辞典』Macmillan.

in other words は同格と推定の2つの用法ありと示されている。

[同格] 言い換えれば、つまり

p. 131 *in other words* はたったいま述べたばかりのことを、別の表現で言いかえる際に用いられる。多くの場合前言の要約として、発言内容（の要点）を最も平易な言い方に直して伝えるのである。

[推定] そうすると

(3) A: I'm afraid there isn't much I can help you with.

B: *In other words*, you don't want to be bothered.

p. 132 ここで B が言おうとしているのは、「あなたのおっしゃることから察すると、あなたはわずらわされたくないのですね」、あるいは「はっきりとおっしゃらないが、あなたはわずらわされたくないというわけですね」、ということである。

so ないしは then (then は〈付随語〉として文尾に置かれることが多い) を用いても、*in other words* の場合と同じく、[推定] を表すことができる。

問題点: so と *in other words* が共起可能なことについては述べられていないので不十分。

1.2. スノードン (1990)『英語リンクワード活用事典』北星堂

特定してつなぐ語句として *namely, that is, in other words, i.e., viz.* があげられている。

p. 52 *in other words* (換言すれば)

(4) The company is in financial difficulty.

In other words, it is about to go bankrupt.

(会社は、金融的な困難に逢着している。換言すれば、倒産寸前にある。)

(5) We were wondering if John might be free on afternoon next month.

In other words, we would like to ask you to make a speech.

(あなたは来月いつか午後、お手すきの日はないでしょうか。つまり、スピーチをお願いしたい、と考えているんです。)

問題点: *that is* と *in other words* が共起することがあることなど何も述べていないし、両者の違いも何も述べていないので不十分である。

1.3. Sylvia Chalker (1996) *Collins COBUILD English Guides 9 : Linking Words*. Harper-Collins.

問題点: Rewording (言い換え) のところに次の5つの表現を与えているだけで、それぞれの違いなどの説明はなく、不十分である。

in other words, that is to say, that is, i.e., namely

p. 52 These are the main connectors that you can use to indicate that you are rewording what you have just said or written.

(6) For the past century or so, geologists have worked on the basis that the present is the key to the past. *In other words*, they use processes familiar today to explain how ancient rocks formed.

1.4. Paul Procter (1995) *Cambridge International Dictionary of English*. CUP
p. 1678

問題点：in other words のみの例文が出ており、so, I mean, you know, well などとの共起については分からないので不十分である。

In other words means expressing the same meaning but in another way, for example by using different words:

- (7) You think he should make a positive career move outside this organization—in other words you think he should leave.

1.5. Della Summers (1995) *Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English*. (3rd edition)
London: Longman. p. 1649

問題点：ロングマンの辞書も例文には(6)のように言語的先行文脈のない in other words から始まる例を出しているのが、不十分だし、他の談話連結詞との共起も分からないので、不十分である。

in other words used to introduce a simpler explanation or version of something you have said:

- (8) *In other words*, the objective is to avoid losing.

- (9) The woman has stopped going through her monthly cycle, *in other words* she is pregnant.

1.6. John Sinclair (1995) *Collins COBUILD English Dictionary*. HarperCollins.

You say *in other words* in order to introduce a different, and usually simpler, explanation or interpretation of something that has just been said.

- (10) The mobile library services have been reorganised—in other words, they visit fewer places.

以上の既存の辞書類は so+in other words が共起することなどいっさい触れていないのですべて不十分であるし、談話連結詞の細かい本質的説明はされていないことも問題である。

2. In other words に関する先行研究と問題点

2.1. Diane Blakemore によるもの

Blakemore の一連の研究は that is と in other words³の違いを明確にすることにあるが、実際の談話では that is +in other words が連語して現れることがあるが、なぜ使えるかという説明はしていないので不十分である。

関連性理論では Wilson and Sperber (1993: 21) が言うように：‘Discourse connectives impose constraints on implicatures: they guide the search for intended contexts and contextual effects’ 多くの談話連結詞は手続きの意味 (procedural meaning) を持ち、交通信号のように談話の流れを頭の中での知識の計算をより容易にするという役割を果たしている。

• Blakemore, Diane (1996) 'Are apposition markers discourse markers?' *Journal of Linguistics* 32 : 325–347.

特徴 1 : *that is* と *in other words* は *so* や *after all* と異なり、先行する言語的コンテキストが必要。

p. 337 'in contrast with so-called discourse markers like *so* and *after all* which can be used in non-linguistic contexts, the use of *that is* or *in other words* is acceptable only in a linguistic or discourse context.'

<p. 120 the function of the so-called discourse connectives *after all* and *moreover* is to constrain the hearer's choice of context and hence the implicatures derived.>.

• Blakemore, Diane (1993) 'The relevance of reformulations' *Language and Literature* 3 (2) 101–120.

特徴 2 : *in other words* はこれまで *apposition markers* と分類されていたものの一つである。

p. 101 'The expression *in other words* is just one example of a range of expressions which have been classified as *apposition markers*'

p. 102 (11) You had better write or *at least* / **in other words* phone.

(12) The hearer must identify the speech act performed by an utterance, *in other words* / **particularly* its illocutionary force.

特徴 3 : *in other words* のあとに置かれる表現は専門用語による表現での言い換えで、思い出して使い、念のために言う、古い情報のこともあるし、新情報のこともある。

<p. 109>The utterance also communicates information about terminology—that the term speech act is equivalent to the term illocutionary force in this context. This information may be relevant as a reminder or it may be represented as new information.

特徴 4 : *in other words* と *that is to say* の分布は以下の例のように異なる。

(13) This legislation will only affect London, *that is to say* / **in other words* Greater London.

特徴 5 : 関連性理論による説明は *in other words* など *Apposition markers* (同格表現の後続を示す言語標識) にも有益である。

p. 102 'My aim in this article is to show that given a relevance theoretic approach to utterance interpretation, it is possible to develop a better understanding of what some of these so-called *apposition markers* indicate.'

特長 6 : 例文 (14) (15) のように *In other words* が推論の言語標識として、用いられている場合がある。

p. 104

(14) A: How did you get on with your semantics this week?

B: Well, I couldn't get any of the books from the library.

A: *In other words*, you didn't do the reading.

(15) A: I think it's time you thought about a new career.

B: *In other words*, I'm fired.

特長 7 : *in other words* は *summary* を導入する言語標識である。

p. 105 *in other words* introduces a summary rather than a paraphrase, and, not surprisingly, in each case it could be replaced by *in short*. Reformulations are not always strict paraphrases.

特長 8 : *summary* は RT では類似性に基づくメタ表示 (解釈的用法) である。

In Sperber and Wilson's (1986) framework, a summary is an example of an utterance which is relevant as an interpretation of another utterance (or block of utterances). In each of these examples the speaker is producing an utterance which is relevant not as a description of a state of affairs but as a representation of another utterance which it resembles.'

1.2. 田中 (1998) によるもの

- 田中廣明 (1998) 『語法と語用論の接点』 (開拓社)

問題点 : 田中の一連の研究も *So* と *In other words* の違いにかなりの力点が置かれているが、実際に *so* と *in other words* と両者が共起することの説明がなされていないので不十分である。

p. 231 *in other words* は、その中心的意味が「言い換えれば、換言すれば」にあり、短く言い換える働きから、「要約」という機能に主眼をおいた表現である。この中心的意味から、*in other words* には、「議論の方向を変え」たり、「容易な言い方」をしたり、逆に「焦点がぼやけて」しまったり、「明確」に述べたり、「要点を整理」する、などの働きがある。

- Tanaka, Hiroaki (1997) '*In other words* and conversational implicature' *Pragmatics* 7 : 3, 367-387.

p. 338 'reformulations are one example of the way utterances may be relevant as representations of utterances which they resemble, or more generally, one example of the way in which a phenomenon can be used to represent another phenomenon which it resembles.'

(16) A: We will have to let her go.

B: *In other words/In short*, she's fired.

In short は同じコンテキスト効果をもっと短く簡潔な形で表せるということを示す発話が後に続くことを示す言語標識である。

p. 339 'the expression *in short* in (16B) encodes the information that the utterance it

prefaces is a shorter, more succinct means of achieving the same contextual effects as the original.’

田中 (1998 : 232)

(17) Patrick works hard; *in other words* he’s an excellent student.

通例は (17) の *in other words* の直後の言葉からもわかるように、「容易な」言い方で述べている。

問題点：容易な言い方とは何かがわかりにくいので問題である。ここでは *works hard* の多岐にわたる意味の曖昧さを避けている *disambiguation* に関わると考えられる。

p. 233 *in other words* は前言と同等のことを述べる際に用いられるため、「つまり」の意味の *or* と共起することがある。

問題点：*or* の機能は並列である。そこから、つまり、の意までの説明が必要と思われる。

p. 236 Blakemore (1996) が見逃しているのは、*in other words* にも「手続き的」「非真理条件的」な意味が存在し、話し手と聞き手の命題間の関係を述べる働きがあることである。

p. 237 Blakemore (1996 : 337–338) は *in other words, that is* を *so, after all* と比較している。*so, after all* は非言語的な文脈（先行文脈に言葉が生じていない場合）に用いられても OK だが、*in other words, that is* はあくまで言語的な文脈がある場合に限られるとしている。

p. 238 *in other words* は、相手が言葉の背後にある真の意味を理解していないと推測し、説明の必要があるときに用いられる。これが「聞き手による含意の解釈」あるいは「推論」を表す機能である。「つまり、それで」という意味になる。

(18) A: I love Schubert’s late piano sonatas.

B: *In other words*, you don’t like the Beethoven sonatas?

(A：私はシューベルトの晩年のピアノソナタが大好きだ。

B：つまり、ベートーベンのソナタは嫌いってわけだ。)

(19) A: I’m going to kill you.

B: *In other words*, you’d like it if I moved my car.

(A：このやろう。殺すぞ。

B：ということは、車をどければご満足なんでしょう。)

(20) Fly me to the moon and let me play among the stars

Let me see what spring is like on Jupiter and Mars

In other words, hold my hand

In other words, darling, kiss me.

(月まで飛ばせて、星の間で遊ばせておくれ／

水星と火星では春がどんなのか見せておくれ／

つまり、私の手を握って／

つまりね、君、キスしておくれ)

問題点：(20) で *in other words* が 2 回使われている説明がされていないが、これはメタ表示の問題なので、メタメタ表示も可能ということと考えられる。

p. 251

(21) A: Sorry, I can't help you now, because I'm busy.

B: **In other words*, you're busy.

in other words がなくても、相手の言葉が何を言いたいかを推定して述べる発話として考えられるものである。

問題点：メタ表示がなくても、既出の言語表現で問題なく伝達可能だから (21B) *in other words* は容認されないと思われる。

p. 252

(22) a. There was \$5 in his wallet. {*So/*?In other words*} he hadn't spent all the money.

b. She's your teacher. {*So/*?In other words*} you must respect her.

p. 253 *so* には推論を表す働きだけでなく、出来事の因果関係 (cause-effect) を述べる働きもある。この働きとしては、通例は、*in other words* での言い換えは不可のようである。

(23) Tom ate condemned meat. {*So/*In other words*} he felt ill.

(24) Bill insulted Mary. {*So/In other words*} she left.

p. 254

(25) They took refreshments, {*that is/*in other words*}, sandwiches, coffee, beer, fruit juice, and chocolate.

問題点：ここでの問題は例文 (22-25) にある *so+in other words* や *that is + in other words* のようにどちらか一方のみ容認可能な場合に注目しているが、実はこれらが 2 つ以上共起してなぜ使用されるかという説明がかけられているので不十分である。

3. British National Corpus および Corpus of Spoken Professional American English によるデータ

まず最初に BNC, CSPA さらに Internet Movie Database (=IMD) の実例の数を比較しておく。4。 *so+in other words* は米語 (CSPA) でも英語 (BNC) でもよく用いられていることが分かるし、*I mean, well, you know, but* など数多くはないが、複数のコーパスで用いられていることが観察できる。また、*That is, in other words* も 1 例存在することがわかる。

| | IOW | or+ | So+ | Well+ | I mean+ | You know+ | but+ | That is+ | Well+so+ |
|------|------|-----|-----|-------|---------|-----------|------|----------|----------|
| BNC | 3223 | 34 | 40 | 2 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| CASP | 241 | 0 | 21 | 0 | 5 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 0 |
| IMD | 7 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

TABLE 1

(TABLE 1 の IOW=in other words の略であり、or+は or + in other words がどれくらい用例あったかを示し、BNC は34例あったことを示している。)

なお BNC での以下の連語の用例はなかった。

actually+ in other words : 0 例

in fact+ in other words : 0 例

namely+ in other words : 0 例

and so+ in other words : 0 例

so therefore + in other words : 0 例

after all+ in other words : 0 例

3.1. BNC による in other words のデータ

問題点：以下 AM6257のように In other words から例文が始まるものが多く、何を言い換えているのかが分からないのでデータの提示する長さが問題である。

• In Other Word の例：

A 6 U 28 These paintings, *in other words*, could only be read as the site of a complex play of forces.

AM 6 257 *In other words*, he sees the informal activities of the drama lesson as a regrettable compromise falling far short of the main purpose of drama, the school play.

B 0 M 265 Although most of the work has been done at concentrations of less than 500 ppm, the LLNL workers have found that the same dose that destroys 500ppm of TCE will reduce 10, 000ppm to 500ppm—*in other words* the X-rays are more effective on higher concentrations.

C 9 J 2448 *In other words*, you shouldn't just hold down the chord shape and pick the notes out as they lie under your hand; each double has its own fingering.

C 9 L 2493 *In other words*, fire up the Transit, shove every member of the band inside, come down and make thorough, absolute pigs of yourselves.

C 9 V 536 The second was the commonly used treatment by opposites—*in other words*, palliative treatment such as laxatives for constipation, which he considered to be a false path.

C 9 V 841 With homoeopathy we aim to treat the intrinsic, inherited components of the disease causation—in other words, to improve the inner state of the individual.

(to 不定詞のくり返しに注意)

CBR 1179 *In other words*, to refer back to the discussion in the previous section, an understanding of theory is needed for evaluation.

CDF 145 *In other words*, you have to assume that these kind of arrangements will become a permanent feature.

CK 3 272 *In other words*, the designer was looking at the effect of the tucking when knitting in one colour, rather than concerning her or himself with the effect when striped.

CKX 1479 *In other words*, how do the angled edges of a shaped field inform what goes on inside it?

CM 5 110 Sometimes it is argued that even if researchers do not really believe in the religion that they are studying, they will get more information if they pretend to do so—if, *in other words*, they use covert, rather than overt, methods of investigation. (if の直後の位置に注意)

CM 5 640 *In other words*, they saw these sub—cultures from a masculine point of view—as happened in Willis' study.

CMA 1038 *In other words*, the genetic relatedness of the partner is likely to be important.

CRA 1095 *In other words*, the economy continues to show modest, non—inflationary growth.

CRA 2578 Though still the branch manager, he has been in hospital for nearly two months—in other words, since about the time the Kunitachi scandal surfaced.

CRR 69 *In other words*, contemporaries viewed bribery as a bargain in which a vote was exchanged for something tangible at a time of election, but quite apart from the general distaste for such transactions, there was insufficient patronage available to permit its lavish use, and there was certainly never enough money.

EB 2 363 *In other words* private property serves to protect the individual's freedom.

ECB 51 *In other words*, women are being offered a considerable financial inducement to turn themselves into 'walking wombs'.

ECN 314 *In other words*, action which is predetermined by some external constraints cannot be seen in the same light as action which accords with some convention, though, on occasion, constrained action may be glossed as rule—governed in an associated account, particularly where the agency of a person is in doubt.

EDY 1092 *In other words*, the original Sadducees would have been a devout dynastic priesthood closely associated with at least the principle of an expected Davidic Messiah.

EW 5 1630 *In other words*, money is no substitute for management.

EWB 931 *In other words*, Leavis is proposing that English be transformed into the study of culture based on “a sense of the subtle ways in which, in a concrete cultural situation, the spiritual and the material are related”.

F 9 S 1563 Family structure, *in other words*, conformed more closely to the nuclear form.

(*in other words* は文頭でなくこのように挿入的にも用いられることがあるので注意)

FA 0 612 *In other words*, this approach uses a concept of industrial change which is broader than that used in long-wave theory.

FB 528 *In other words*, those Greeks who did not profit, as did Pytharchos, Themistokles or Memnon, from the Persian presence, preferred self-government to good but alien government.

FBD 1292 Apology, *in other words*, is aimed at convincing anyone interested that the miscreant recognises his fault, and by that token alone, is to be regarded as someone whose typical tendency is to observe the conventions.

FTV 786 *In other words*, I shall dispute that ontological existents can be coherently treated in an uncritical metaphysical fashion as “things (existing unconditionally) in themselves”.

G 0 R 486 On this analysis, it follows that irrationality could mean either a reluctance to adopt the particular norms within a mode of thought (i.e. a disinclination to fall in with the substantive rationality of the discipline in question) or a determination, perverse or otherwise, to impose a constraint of some kind on the open discourse of the discipline (*in other words*, to distort the procedural rationality of the academic community).

G 0 U 295 *In other words*, existing social/organisational arrangements are still considered to be legitimate, or natural, and the main question which remains is how to control or utilise inevitable conflicts.

G 1 A 293 She is talking, *in other words* (and in both senses), to herself.

G 2 J 744 *In other words*, the West has an interest in the maintenance of nationalism, but only in its most backward form: the sovereign nation-state, so long as it is powerless, dependent and relatively small.

GUJ 931 *In other words*, he wished to give his own canvases a dimension that in a sense already existed in sculpture, or at least in free-standing sculpture.

GWB 934 ‘*In other words*, he’s a bit gaga.’

H 0 K 1606 The stress laid on the new Festival of Purification of the Temple favours a date in the late second century B.C. *In other words*, I am inclined to put both I and II Maccabees in the last decades of the second century B.C., about forty or fifty years after the death of Antiochus IV in 164 B.C. The two main Jewish sources were written when Judaea had become an independent and expansionist state.

H 8 K 375 It follows that a Euclidean surface with metric equation will match the curved surface locally at P. *In other words* a plane can always be drawn at any arbitrary point on a two dimensional Riemann surface so that it is locally tangential to the surface.

H 8 V 328 *In other words*, although the Formalists took a very important step in making language central to their definition of literature, their theoretical shortcomings could largely be attributed to their failure to extend a theory of language to other spheres.

HHY 5053 *In other words*, we shall be exploring the cognitive and affective factors which influence how children of different ages (5 , 8 and 11 year-olds) understand and make decisions about secrecy.

HUK 350 *In other words*, it looks as if mothers erm actively discriminate against er embryos which are not normal and are not gonna develop into into in in into er offspring who will survive.

HWH 1480 *In other words*, the area under the marginal cost curve MC up to Oq b is just equal to the area under the demand curve, and therefore P o 12 equals triangle 234.

HXD 1320 *In other words*, who is the contracting party?

J 0 U 1202 *In other words*, the conventional assumption that agents attempt to optimize does not guarantee that the eventual outcome of such attempts will be a market clearing equilibrium.

J16 840 *In other words*, a scarcity value attaches at present to the possession of a licence.

J52 1097 Our model, *in other words*, is strictly a model of artificial selection, not natural selection.

J 7 X 289 *In other words*, while the original does not communicate what the speaker wished to communicate, the reformulation does.

J 9 P 1061 *In other words* you've got the trading account which is how 's trading, the committee account, the petty cash and the wages box are part and parcel of the trading but they're kept as separate entities within the organization.

JA 1 169 *In other words* they can't tell price because they measure up and all things

KBX 1348 One of the big ways is, is spiritualism and things that are not real, things that are sort of er blind in the mind of the unbeliever as it were, *in other words* material things probably and things that have under revelation

KSN 90 Straight, *in other words*

• BNC による you know + in other words の例 :

Results of your search

Your query was

you know in other words

Only 3 solutions found for this query

J 9 X 37 *You know in other words*

K71 202 Erm tt whether that's appropriate, you know, I'm thinking of it as a first appointment just to get a general picture whereas you might be coming back to stir his memory for referrals by saying er, you know, er you mentioned here you're a member of the squash club, do you remember I said I'd be looking for introductions, maybe we'll learn whether at the beginning of the second appointment you jog the memory there er *you know in other words* what I'm do doing is keeping that in my mind, that you are remembering the squash club or whatever club it may be and use that later, although I didn't er elaborate on it at that, that er because I think you can go off at a tangent
KBX 1045 *you know in other words* it might take a bit of time to work it out, there is some reason why he must of said that mustn't didn't he?

• BNC による Well+ in other words の例：

Results of your search

Your query was

well in other words

Only 2 solutions found for this query

JJL 568 *Well in other words* the pragmatic consideration's far more important than the ideological one is.

JJY 85 *well in other words* that means reprinting that page doesn't it?, page thirty one

3.2. Corpus of Spoken Professional American English によるデータ

CSPA では以下の例で分かるように *in other words* と *So* や *I mean* などとの共起関係がたどころに検索できるので、このような談話連結詞の共起関係のデータとしてはとても役に立つことが分かった。ただし、個々の例は長いコーパスを見れば、その前後関係は分かるが、それを見つけだすのに時間がかかるという欠点がある。

E:¥WH97B: 2. ...extend inside the White House? *I mean, [[in other words]],* will the process look inward, as well?...

E:¥WH97B: 5. ...many of those populations live—if, *[[in other words]],* he became someone other than the Sadda...

E:¥COMM597: 7. ...t are the reporting requirements. *So [[in other words]],* we will know then how schools and dist...

E:¥COMM597: 19. ...page 1 at the bottom of Section 3. *So [[in other words]],* it's one, two—counting is one of th...

E:¥COMM597: 29. ...u give back, you give back a score. *So, [[in other words]],* there

would be an underlying scale bu...

E:¥COMM697: 39. ...purposes, basically shut it off. *So* *[[in other words]]*, there is a dead time limit at which pa...

E:¥COMM697: 42. ...then are bled off to the Xerox. *But* *[[in other words]]*, you are looking at the percentage, you...

E:¥COMM797: 71. ...e awkward. <SP>BASS:</SP> Right. *So*, *[[in other words]]*, — a document that the employees of th...

E:¥COMM797: 73. ...e's going to be staff development. *So*, *[[in other words]]*, the language should also be one that c...

E:¥COMM897: 76. ...hey looked, mathematically. *That is*, *[[in other words]]*, we can handle the technical psychometr...

E:¥COMM897: 82. ...erview. <SP>BURRILL:</SP> Right. *So*, *[[in other words]]*, that little thing on page 9 doesn't a...

E:¥COMM897: 84. ...valuable to have a rationale—I mean, *[[in other words]]*, you could also have a rationale withi...

E:¥COMM897: 85. ...NAEP, we need to improve on NAEP. *But*, *[[in other words]]*, I'm not sure that you can prescribe t...

E:¥COMM897: 95. ...) the response. <SP>SEELEY:</SP> *So* *[[in other words]]*, you would envision the students gettin...

E:¥COMM 8 A97: 104. ...for the students to complete it. *So*, *[[in other words]]*, giving an extra30percent which then...

E:¥COMM 8 A97: 106. ...and then pass it on to the test. *So* *[[in other words]]*, do we expand the conversation about ca...

E:¥COMM 8 A97: 111. ...the actual numbers in the grid. *But* *[[in other words]]*, the plan to design a test that we beli...

E:¥COMR 6 A97: 137. ...of reading for literary experience. *[[In other words]]*, you know, if you have for eighth grade...(you know が挿入的にあとで用いられた例)

E:¥COMR 6 A97: 140. ...rdingly as well. <SP>HORTON:</SP> *So* *[[in other words]]*, you're saying if it's not in the NAEP,...

E:¥COMR 6 B97: 150. ...things to happen. <SP>HOHL:</SP> *So* *[[in other words]]*, maybe students that didn't do well on...

E:¥COMR 6 B97: 152. ...D:</SP> Right. <SP>PHILLIPS:</SP> *So* *[[in other words]]*, a student will not only get back a sco...

E:¥COMR 6 B97: 154. ...o really get the information out. *So* *[[in other words]]*, it's being used. But I don't know how...

E:¥COMR797: 173. ...be different. *I mean*, (*Inaudible*). *[[In other words]]*, I think the

short constructed and the...

E:¥COMR797: 176. ...to the second literary paragraph. *So* *[[in other words]]*, what I'd like to see there is a paragr...

E:¥COMR797: 192. ...e muddled. <SP>KAPINUS:</SP> *I mean*, *[[in other words]]*—<SP>LANGER:</SP> It's real inaccu...

E:¥WH94: 205. ...n Democracy Act. <SP>VOICE:</SP> *So* *[[in other words]]*, Moynihan, no. <SP>MYERS:</SP> We'r...

E:¥WH94: 209. ...o make that feasible. But, again—*so*, *[[in other words]]*, if there is enough interest among you...

E:¥WH95: 215. ...finition to use. <SP>VOICE:</SP> *So*, *[[in other words]]*, you've made this decision without deci...

E:¥WH95: 217. ...of those cases. <SP>VOICE:</SP> *So*, *[[in other words]]*, they still have information that they...

E:¥WH96B: 226. ...ould buy their own or what—you *know*, *[[in other words]]*, what are the international indications...

E:¥WH96B: 229. ...20billion in water-borne traffic. *So*, *[[in other words]]*, a fairly impressive increase of almos...

E:¥WH96B: 230.n those matters. <SP>VOICE:</SP> *So*, *[[in other words]]*, you want to convince them to toughen i...

E:¥WH96B: 231. ...parate what? <SP>VOICE:</SP> *I mean*, *[[in other words]]*, none of them went over the \$ 1,000 limi...

3.3. その他のコーパスによる検索

さらに Simple search of Public Domain Modern English Text Collection では *so+in other words* が 1 例あった。

HEARING OF THE SENATE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE ON THE NOMINATION OF CLARENCE THOMAS TO THE SUPREME COURT

Part II October 11 1991

of 1982, and she transferred with me. SEN. HATCH:SEN. ORRIN HATCH, R-UT *So in other words* Professor Hill followed you to the EEOC no more than two or three months, possibly only one

また Internet Movie Database (IMD:Quote Search) では *in other words* を含む以下の例が検索され、6 番の例に *so+in other words* の 1 例があった。

Here are the quotes containing *in other words*

1. Juliette Janson in *Deux ou trois choses que je sais d'elle* (1966) said

Something may make me cry, but the reason for my tears is not contained in their traces on my cheeks. *In other words*, you can describe what happens what I do something, without necessarily indicating what makes me do it.

2. Seth Gecko in *From Dusk Till Dawn* (1996) said

In other words, no.

3. Kwang in *Licence to Kill* (1989) said

In other words... bribery.

4. Felix Ungar in *Odd Couple, The* (1968) said

In other words, you're saying you want me to leave?

5. Oscar Madison in *Odd Couple, The* (1968) said

Not *in other words*! Those are the perfect words!

6. Marty in *This Is Spinal Tap* (1984) said

So in other words if we were to take all your flesh and blood...

7. Narrator in *War and Peace* (1968/I) said

Narrator: On 12th June, 1812, the forces of western Europe crossed the frontiers of Russia and war began. *In other words*, an event took place that was contrary to all human reason and human nature.

4. *In other words* と他の談話連結詞との共起関係

4.1. or + in other words

or: a marker of parallel processing

in other words: 'the expression IN OTHER WORDS encodes the information that the utterance it prefaces is a summary of the previous linguistic expression or thought.'

Or による<並列する>という計算と *In other words* による<先行言語コンテキストの要約>という計算は頭の中では、矛盾なく処理でき (並列内容=要約)、無理な処理努力(Processing effort)もかけずに relevance の度合いを低くせずに可能となると考えられる。

BNC による or+ in other words の例:

- (26) a. These objections imply that technology cannot be a guide to other aspects of society, *or in other words* that there is no inevitable association between technology and other aspects of society. (that 節のくり返しに注意)
- b. Two substances that look about the same under light, *or in other words*, reflect light in about the same way, may be totally different in regard to how much sound they absorb or reflect. (動詞句のくり返しに注意)
- c. Bars 1 - 2 of this part rely on the intervals of thirds, sixths, and flat fifths—or

- in other words* the interval structure of the B 7 and Bb 7 dominant chord structures that are used. (名詞句のくり返しに注意)
- d. Together these trends towards pressure, protest and censorship at a national level, demand in turn from librarians a national and global response, *or in other words* a consistent and professional approach to and reaction against censorship.
- e. This is not to say that the position is wrong but only that it is arguable, *or in other words*, open to conceptual evaluation. (形容詞の並列の場合)
- f. In most cases it will be personal *or in other words* movable property. (形容詞の並列の場合)
- g. Although the positions and sizes of most settlements in this region were due almost solely to the way in which people organised themselves, *or in other words* due to human factors, a few depended on the landforms, or physical factors. (due to のくり返しに注意)
- h. This article is concerned with the question of what this plan might be, *or in other words*, with the relevance of reformulations. (前置詞 with のくり返しに注意)

4.2. So+ *in other words* の説明

So: procedural: Process Q as a conclusion <P. So Q>

In other words: 'the expression IN OTHER WORDS encodes the information that the utterance it prefaces is a summary of the previous linguistic expression or thought.'

So による<結論を導く>という計算と *in other words* による<先行言語コンテキストの要約>という計算は矛盾なく処理でき(結論=要約)、頭の中ではごく自然な形で処理されると説明できる。

(27) Ridley Scott (British): I think at the moment I watch CNN and Good Morning America, and occasionally if there's a film on cable I'll watch that, and that's about it. *So in other words*, it's really to do with catching up with world events and sports. —*The Best of The English Journal Interviews* 文化編 1, p. 36

(いまのところ私自身は『CNN』と『グッドモーニング・アメリカ』、それからケーブルテレビで映画があれば見ますが、そのくらいしか見ていません。世界の出来事とスポーツの動きについていくだけのことです。)

• BNC の例:

F 7 F 1354 *So in other words*, some suggestion that these headings

F 7 G 655 Right, *so in other words*, we just take it out of the files, keep the children infor-

mation in the tutor's office and just extract what you want to put in somewhere else?

FUT 285 *So in other words* you're covered by the, well you're covered by both the Sale of Goods Act and the Trade Descriptions Act.

G 5 K 879 *So in other words* I'll I'll raise up somebody to fill my shoes I suppose.

H 5 D 395 I understand, *so in other words* your research isn't actually going to tell us more than

HUF 93 *So in other words*, Mill accepts the arguments of Russo the arguments of the participatory er theorists that participation in government, participation in public affairs is a good thing, people should be encouraged to participate and it has an improving effect.

HUF 138 *So in other words* they should be paid the salaries they would have been got getting in whatever their other line of work would have been, rather than special rates of the job of an M P.

HUJ 335 The decision based on a number of current offspring, larger numbers can be greater benefited with and therefore it's more likely that if the parent had a lot of er offspring then he would continue with the investment and erm the conclusion from now is that males have a greater reproductive success, therefore they are more likely to desert because they can erm and erm this and erm the basic argument of this is one parent can get away with investing less share of erm resources they're likely to spend more er then they're to do it, *so in other words* erm if, if one of the, of the two is being to get away with having the other they can go out to er pursue their own and therefore erm each partner force the other to invest more.

HUK 263 *So in other words* they were just like any other sibling, just happens to be they were erm conceived at the same time and er developed in the womb together.

HUL 558 *So in other words* that kind of dream represents an extreme example of erm of an aborted dream, but the very fact that it's repetitive and you keep having them, Freud would say, is, is a demonstration of the fundamental idea, th that the dream attempts to try and put the past right as it were, you try and dream about it, but you fail all the time.

HVH 741 *So in other words* you you are saying instead of six to eight, it's six to ten.

HYF 208 Advertisement er, revenue at Westminster Press ended the six months at about the, advert revenue about the same level as last year but it was below last year's level early on, *so in other words* erm, advertisement volume is growing, because there's next to no, there's, the yield is about the same overall.

J 3 S 173 And we found that about twenty two percent of the er, sheep being entered, had been dipped within the period, *so in other words* they'd not been withheld, so it's a con-

cern.

J 8 K 211 *So in other words* we can write the general scheme, a stimulus leads to an increase in the se level of the second messenger, and that increase in the level of the second messenger leads to a response.

J97 567 *So in other words* qualitative, the whole of qualitative between commissioning as merit checks has an er

J 9 T 523 *So in other words*, acceptance of the of the principal in preference

J 9 X 556 *So in other words* if you're there for two to three weeks you're solidly for .

JA 2 359 *So in other words* you don't go out that door without a decision.

JA 2 1113 *So in other words* he comes round and he says I I don't want that there I want a little bit put there

JA 9 924 Although we might be prepared outside our normal scheme to fund the current year's training for such people on the understanding that future funding will not be available, *so in other words* if somebody comes along to you and says, I'd like to do an M B A, beginning this year, now normally we we would say, yes, we will contribute our half to that cost, er and that would then be a high priority on our budget to provide continued support for the rest of that M B A course, we're now saying that that the answer is actually no, because we cannot provide support next year, we don't think, er but if you never the less want to go ahead this year and then fund it yourself from then on, then we we have actually got money available which we can use this year.

JSA 687 *So in other words* it's about an introduction an expansion and an end Now as I've said tomorrow I'll fill in a bit more detail on those so if you leave some some gaps there between those three sections.

JST 222 *So in other words* he's saying, you should look to history to try and understand what's happening.

JST 281 *So in other words* he makes a joke about his if they all looked like me, wouldn't that be awful.

JSV 485 They get *so in other words* men

JT 3 581 *So in other words*, we're saying if they're off sick, erm, they decide to go out and, you know, do something else to earn some money, then they wouldn't be able to claim under their policy.

K 6 G 81 *So in other words*, all new accommodation will be of a cellular type.

K 6 J 224 *So in other words* we got eight tens left over on the bottom.

K70 909 *So in other words* then just to, just to summarize erm if I can come or if I can come up with er a recommendation to provide that sort of cover within that er price range erm then erm is there, is there any reason why when I do that er next time that

you couldn't, come back with an appointment next week, that you couldn't er proceed?

KBM 1908 No, it's either empty or full of crap *so in other words* it's empty for me, all the time

KCN 3642 *So in other words* you don't go to the caravan.

KCV 5664 the vice president or someone, *so in other words* says, I'm, I'm sorry we can't, it would, would have been tomorrow morning.

KD 4 643 *So in other words* that

KDY 927 *So in other words* their monopoly begins with an N.

KE 2 8836 *So in other words* it was an unilateral decision

KLK 83 *So in other words* is our F T E consistent with where we actually are rather than where we thought we'd be erm or have we got erm you know er the Parkinson's law, been operating with the, the overtime, people are used to doing it and therefore they keep doing it and so on.

KM 7 641 Er *so in other words* it it muddies the water and it seems to me that it's quite unnoted because it be suggesting a policy which is to counteract the effect of erm section fifty four A.

KRL 1728 *So in other words*, you're really talking about taking the lid off a can of worms here.

KSV 80 *So in other words* they're gonna bring its new place?

KSV 2693 *So in other words* the money from your life insurance will pay the mortgage?

• CSPA の例 ::

D:¥WH96B: *So, in other words*, you want to convince them to toughen it up?

D:¥WH96B: *So, in other words*, a fairly impressive increase of almost 40 percent in that cargo traffic since 1992, and obviously that's because of export increases, the United States selling more abroad.

E:¥COMM597: *So in other words*, we will know then how schools and districts and states — what are the limits of the reporting.

E:¥COMM597: *So in other words*, it's one, two—counting is one of the attriburtes of mathematics.

E:¥COMM597: *So in other words*, there woudl be an underlying scale but the parent would never see it.

• IMD の例 :

1. Marty in *This Is Spinal Tap* (1984) said
[Marty compliments Nigel on his tee shirt.]

Nigel: You like this?

Marty: It's very nice. It looks like hollow wood.

Nigel: This is my exact inner structure, done in a tee shirt. Exactly medically accurate. See?

Marty: *So in other words* if we were to take all your flesh and blood...

Nigel: Take them off. This is what you'd see.

Marty: It wouldn't be green though.

[Nigel points at Marty.]

Nigel: It is green. You see how your blood looks blue.

Marty: Yeah, well that's just the vein. That's the color of the vein. The blood is actually red.

Nigel: Oh then, maybe it's not green. Anyway this is what I sleep in sometimes.

Cf. COBUILD Online Search (Simple Search) による so+ in other words の例:

British speech : 25例

American books : 5 例 (うち 1 例は So-so in other words)

British books : 6 例 (うち 1 例は And so, in other words)

Cf. COBUILD <British books> So+to put it another way 0 例

Cf. COBUILD <British Books>

consequently/thus/therefore+ in other words 0 例

after all + in other words 0 例

4.3. I mean + in other words の説明

I mean: procedural: Renegotiate the cognitive environments, because some of the manifest assumptions are mistaken.

In other words: <P. In other words Q> :

IN OTHER WORDS: 'the expression IN OTHER WORDS encodes the information that the utterance it prefaces is a summary of the previous linguistic expression or thought.'

I mean による <明白と思われている想定 (知識) の一部が間違いであるので、認知環境をもう一度やり直しなさい> という計算指令と *in other words* による <先行言語コンテキストを (別の言い方で) 要約せよ> という計算とは矛盾なくおこなわれるので、並列可能と説明ができる (想定の一部の間違い=別の言い方で要約)。

• BNC の例 :

I mean + in other words 1 例

(28) Sorry I was going to go down to get an authorization from Age Concern. I missed the

first bit, but erm if resources are allowed for this work, would it not be better to aim them at priority areas, and not wards, *I mean, in other words*, to put it to the areas that needed most.

KRL 2211 *I mean in other words* we'll now have a proper strategy the Vale of the White Horse, which was always an area of the county where the County Council services to the elderly was poorer than elsewhere.

- CSPA の例：

D:¥WH97B: 2: *I mean, in other words*, will the process look inward, as well?

D:¥WH96B: *I mean, in other words*, none of them went over the \$1,000 limit.

4.4. Well+ in other words

well: Renegotiate the relevant background assumptions.

in other words: 'the expression IN OTHER WORDS encodes the information that the utterance it prefaces is a summary of the previous linguistics expression or thought.'

Well は<関係ある背景知識をもう一度やり変えよ>という計算の指令であり、 *in other words* は<先行する言語コンテキストを（別の言葉で）要約せよ>という指令であり、両者は矛盾なく頭の中で並列して、処理が可能であると説明できる（背景知識の変化＝別の言葉で要約）。

- BNC の例：

well in other words

Only 2 solutions found for this query

JJL 568 *Well in other words* the pragmatic consideration's far more important than the ideological one is.

JJY 85 *well in other words* that means reprinting that page doesn't it?, page thirty one

4.5. You know + in other words

you know: Renegotiate the cognitive environments, because a new set of assumptions are relevant.

in other words: 'the expression IN OTHER WORDS encodes the information that the utterance it prefaces is a summary of the previous linguistics expression or thought.'

You know は<新しい情報（想定）が関連あるので、もう一度認知環境をやり直しなさい>という計算の指令であり、 *in other words* は<先行言語コンテキストを（別の言葉で）要約せよ>という指令である。両者は（新しい情報を入れて認知環境を変える＝別の言葉で要約）と

して理解されるので並列可能である。

• CSPA の例 :

D:¥WH96B: Is the idea, then , that either hey would be able to use this very machine or is it that

they would buy their own or what—you know, in other words, would he take half the loaf?

4.6. But in other words

but: Adopt the conclusion drawn from Q, and deny the previous conclusion. <P. But Q>

in other words: 'the expression IN OTHER WORDS encodes the information that the utterance it prefaces is a summary of the previous linguistic expression or thought.'

But は<先行する情報から来る結論をやめて、後続する情報(あるいはそれから導かれる結論)をとりなさい>という計算の指令であり、in other words は<先行する言語コンテキストを(別の言葉で)要約せよ>という指令であり、両者は連結可能である。すなわち、(後続する情報=要約)であると解釈されると説明可能である。

• BNC の例 :

Yeah *but in other words* what I'm saying is that there are diff

• CASP の例 :

E:¥COMM697: 42. ...then are bled off to the Xerox. *But [[in other words]]*, you are looking at the percentage, you...

E:¥COMM897: 85. ...NAEP, we need to improve on NAEP. *But, [[in other words]]*, I'm not sure that you can prescribe t...

4.7. Others

BNC のつぎの例のように 3 つ以上 well+so+in other words の連語関係もある。

FUK 23 *Well so in other words* you haven't done the bridge office?

(Well+so+in other words の 3 つの談話連結詞の連語に注意)

また以下のような連語関係は観察されなかった。

**In fact in other words*

**After all in other words*

**Then in other words*

IN FACT: strengthening an existing assumption

AFTER ALL: Process Q as a denial of expectation P <P. After all Q>

THEN: Process Q as a conclusion based on some hypothetical reasoning. <P. THEN Q>

6. おわりに

本稿では TABLE 1 に示したように in other words と共起する談話連結詞を BNC, CASP のデータを中心に検証した。認知語用論による説明は頭の中での計算の仕方の制限のため、〈結論を導く〉計算を求める so と〈先行する言語コンテキストの要約を導く〉in other words は processing effort (処理努力) に問題なく、並列可能だが、〈存在する想定をさらに強めよ〉という in fact と〈先行する言語コンテキストの要約を導く〉in other words とは同一のものの強めを求め、変化を期待しない in fact と言葉での表現の変化を求める in other words で内部で矛盾が生じ、処理できないし、after all のように逆行処理するものとは in other words のように順行処理するものとは相容れないこともわかる。That is と in other words の連語は 1 例だけあり、おそらく同一領域にある談話連結詞で〈要約〉する場合に別の言葉で要約するということの強めと考えられる。That is to say は単に内容的に要約する、さらに in other words は前置詞 in から分かるように言葉を入れ物に見立てて、別の入れ物に入れ変えて要約する場合、すなわち、メタ言語的要約を明確に述べる言い方と考えられる。これらの共起は apposition harmony と考えられる。

さらに詳しい説明はこの分野の今後の研究を待たなくてはならない。

Notes:

1. 本稿は「関連性理論による談話連結詞と文法化の接点」と題する1998年度神戸女学院大学研究所研究助成を受けたものの一部の公表である。ここに記して感謝の意を表したい。Author's E-mail address: i-higasi@mail.kobe-c.ac.jp
2. 最新の談話連結詞の研究の動向について少し見よう。
文法化 (grammaticalization) と談話連結詞 like (Andersen 1998), why (Schourup 1995) などの研究は今後、認知意味論などとの研究ともつながり広がりを見せている。また、but など対比を表す研究が Bell (1998), Fraser (1998) でいまだに研究が続いている難しい問題であることが分かる。日本語と英語の談話連結詞の対照研究も Takahara (1998) などで行われ、今後の進展が期待される分野である。
3. Halliday & Hasan (1976) は apposition markers として: that is, in other words, at least, in short, for instance をあげている。
4. BNC で to put it another way は79例で in other words 3223例に比べるとかなり、少ない。

Cf. COBUILD :IOW

British books 2 例

American books 5 例

British speech 4 例

Cf. COBUILD

I mean + in other words 0 例

that is/namely + in other words 0 例

Bibliography

- Andersen, Gisle (1998) 'The Pragmatic Marker like from a Relevance-theoretic Perspective' In Jucker and Ziv (1998) pp. 147-170.
- Ball, W.J. 1986. *Dictionary of Link Words in English Discourse*. London: Macmillan. (中田裕二・岸野英治訳1997『あいづちつなぎ語辞典』Macmillan.)
- Bell, David (1998) 'Cancellative discourse markers: A core/periphery approach' *Pragmatics* 8 : 4, pp. 515-541.
- Blakemore, D. 1988a. "So' as a constraint on relevance." In R.Kempson (ed.) *Mental Representations: The Interface between Language and Reality*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. pp. 183-195.
- Blakemore, D.1989b. "Denial and contrast: A relevance theoretic anlaysis of BUT." *Journal of Philosophical Semantics* 12 : 15-37.
- Blakemore, Diane (1993) 'The relevance of reformulations' *Language and Literature* 3 (2)101-120.
- Blakemore, Diane (1996) 'Are apposition markers discourse markers?' *Journal of Linguistics* 32 : 325-347.
- Chalker, Sylvia (1996) *Collins COBUILD English Guides 9:Linking Words*. London: HarperCollins.
- Corpus of Spoken, Professional American English* (1998) Houston: Athelstan.
- Fraser, Bruce (1998) 'Contrative Discourse Markers in English.' In Jucker and Ziv (1998) pp. 301-26.
- Halliday, M.A.K. and R. Hasan. 1976. *Cohesion in English*. London: Longman.
- Higashimori, I. 1992b. "BUT/YET/STILL and Relevance Theory." *Narita Yoshimitsu Kyogyu Kanreki Shukuga Ronbunshu*. Tokyo: Eihosha. pp. 333-54.
- Jucker,A.H. 1993. "The discourse marker well: A relevance-theoretic account." *Journal of Pragmatics* 19 : 435-52.
- Jucker, Anreas H. & Yael Ziv (1998) *Discourse Markers: Descriptions and Theory*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Procter, Paul (1995) *Cambridge International Dictionary of English*. Cambridge: CUP
- Schourup, Lawrence (1995) The discourse particle 'Why' *Joshidai bungaku: a journal of western languages and cultures* vol. 47, pp. 119-190.
- Sinclair, John (1995) *Collins COBUILD English Dictionary*. London: Haper Collins.
- Snowdon, P. 1990『英語リンクワード活用事典』東京：北星堂。
- Sperber,D.and D.Wilson. 1986. 1995. *Relevance*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Summers, Della (1995) *Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English*. (3 rd edition) London:Longman.
- Takahara, Paul O. (1998) 'Pragmatic Functions of the English Discourse Marker *anyway* and its Corresponding Contrastive Japanese Discourse Markers.' In Jucker and Ziv (1998) pp. 327-351.
- Tanaka, Hiroaki (1997) 'In other words and conversational implicature' *Pragmatics* 7 : 3 , 367-387.

田中廣明 (1998) 『語法と語用論の接点』 (開拓社)

Wilson, D. and D. Sperber. 1993. "Linguistic form and relevance." *Lingua* 90 : 1 –25.

(原稿受理1999年 4 月16日)